

Use Cases. Music Work Group

Ken Calkins, Manuel Erviti, David Gilbert, Eunice Schroeder.

Summary of Issues for music materials.

1. Record Display. Record display needs to be improved dramatically for WorldCat Local to function as a successful OPAC for music users on the UC Campuses. Record display is an issue in Cases 1, 3, 4, 5, 10, and 11.

Although it is useful that the Keyword search seems to search the contents note, the contents note does not display until after clicking on Details. It will not be obvious why the results were achieved until after several steps into the search. Further, many systems highlight the keywords searched, making it clear where the item you searched for is in the record display. WorldCat Local does not. We recommend contents notes appear in the initial individual record display.

Searches 1 and 3, and many searches for music in all genres, depend greatly on the uniform title. It appears that WorldCat Local is searching the uniform title (cases 1 and 3, for example), but it displays nowhere at any level of the display. This is a severe drawback. We recommend that uniform titles display at all levels of the search results.

In both of these cases, WorldCat Local seems to be retrieving results from information that is not displayed at all, or only displayed deep into the search process. This is confusing to users who will not understand why they are seeing what they see.

2. Record display of sound recordings and video. Cases 10,11. The record display of items without an author entry, cataloged by title main entry, can be totally confusing for users. It will again not be clear why a search retrieved that particular record even though it may be relevant to their search.

3. Lack of browse searching. The ability to browse by subject or call number is very important in music as it is the only way to list all of the music for a particular instrumentation--a common search by music students and performers--or all of the works by a particular composer in a rational list. (Mozart's sonatas arranged by Köchel number). Musicians know these numbers and want to use them in searches. The lack of a browse search by Author and Title, Library of Congress Subject Headings or LC call number is a severe limitation. We recommend this be implemented in WorldCat Local.

3. Limiting by Content and Format. Cases 4,5,10,11. WorldCat Local does not provide a way to limit to video recordings nor specifically to DVDs. The Format "Visual Materials" limits to any kind of visual material, not necessarily providing significantly fewer results to browse through. The term "visual materials" will not be obvious to very many users.

The limit by Content (which seems to be based on subject headings?) is of very little use for music since the only limit is Music and results still include a mixture of books, scores, recordings, etc.

4. In what order are results displayed? It appears to be random.

Case 1: Known item, specific published edition.

User(s)

- The users include undergraduate students, graduate students and faculty members.

Assumptions

Description of use

- The user is looking for a specific published edition from among many possible editions of a common piece of music. Bach's Two part Inventions in the Henle Urtext Edition.

Current method of support

Melvyl Basic Search:

Keywords: bach inventions henle.

0 items retrieved.

Not supported. Search fails (keyword search does not search uniform title (240)?)

Melvyl Advanced Search

Title: inventions
Author: bach johann Sebastian
Publisher: Henle

6 items retrieved, all correct.

World Cat Local:

Keyword: bach inventions henle

10 items retrieved. 8 are correct. One of the incorrect records is a Henle edition of Bach's 3-part inventions, and one is a sound recording. Because only two of the correct records (and the sound recording) show the word "inventions" in the record list and brief record display, it is not readily clear that the search worked because Keyword is

searching the uniform title, which appears only in Details in a severely truncated form. The uniform title should be labeled as such and should display on all levels.

Advanced Search:

Keyword: henle

Author: Bach

Title: Inventions

3 items retrieved. These are the same three records retrieved in the Keyword search that have the word "inventions" in the 245 titles. Where are the other editions? This search failed because the Title field does not include the uniform title. Because of the importance of uniform titles in music searching, this is a serious omission.

-

Case 2: Known work, score and recording, conventional title.

User(s)

Users include undergraduate students, graduate students and faculty members.

Assumptions

Description of use

User is looking for a score and recording of a symphony by its associated conventional title

Current method of support

Melvyl Basic Search:

Keywords: haydn drum roll symphony

46 items retrieved, all correct (includes excerpts/ arrangements). Missing from the result are items that are items only cataloged by uniform title without the conventional title as a content note or title added entry.

Melvyl Advanced Search 1:

Title [words as phrase= no]: drum roll symphony

Author [keywords in name]: haydn

33 items retrieved. Missing from the result are items as described in the Basic Search above plus recordings (that include other works) lacking this title added entry.

Melvyl Advanced Search 2:

Author/Title: haydn/drum roll symphony

31 items retrieved. Missing from the result are recordings as above.

Melvyl provides a uniform title link ("Find Related Items") (either as 240 or title added entry), in this case the full result is 60 items:

The screenshot shows the Melvyl search interface. At the top, the Melvyl logo and the text "The Catalog of the University of California Libraries" are visible. A navigation bar includes links for "Basic Search", "Advanced", "Command", "Browse", and "Most Rec". The search results section displays "Search results: 31 Item(s)" with a "Modify Search" button. Below this, it shows the search criteria: "Searched: Author/Title= haydn drum roll symphony" and "Collection: Entire Collection". Action buttons for "Print / Email", "Save", and "Request" are present, along with "select all" and "deselect all" links. A checkbox is next to the number "1" and a link to "Details/Locations". The metadata for the first result is shown: "Author Haydn, Joseph, 1732-1809.", "Uniform Title [Symphonies, H. I, 103, E b major]", and "Title Sinfonie in Es : 'Mit dem Paukenwirbel' (Lon...".

Find Related Items

→ **Find other items** in the Melvyl Catalog
Title (Exact) : Symphonies, H. I, 103, E b major

→ **Browse this alphabetical index** in the Melvyl Catalog
Title (Exact) : Symphonies, H. I, 103, E b major

The screenshot shows the Melvyl search interface. At the top, the Melvyl logo and the text 'The Catalog of the University of California Libraries' are visible. Navigation links include 'Basic Search', 'Advanced', 'Command', 'Browse', and 'Most Rec'. The search results section displays 'Search results: 60 Item(s)' with a 'Modify Search' button. Below this, it shows the searched terms 'Symphonies, H. I, 103, E b major' and the collection 'Entire Collection'. Action buttons for 'Print / Email', 'Save', and 'Request' are present, along with links for 'select all' and 'deselect all'. A navigation bar shows 'Browse Previous: Symphonies, H. I, 103, E? major. 1976.', 'Current: Symphonies, H. I, 103, E b major', and 'Browse Next: Symphonies, H. I, 103, E b major. 1952.'. At the bottom, there is a checkbox for '1 Details/Locations' and the author information 'Author Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus, 1756-1791'.

World Cat Local 1:

Keyword: haydn drum roll symphony

113 items retrieved, all correct.

World Cat Local 2:

Advanced Search:

Author: haydn

Title: drum roll symphony

57 items retrieved. Missing from the result are items only cataloged by uniform title without content note or added entry for the conventional title.

There is no apparent provision for cross-reference to the uniform title to obtain a complete result set.

Case 3: Known item, score and recording, uniform title search.

User(s)

Users include undergraduate students, graduate students and faculty members.

Assumptions

Description of use

The user is looking for a score and recording of a known symphony (without a conventional title) often identified by its unique composer thematic catalog number.

Current method of support

Melvyl Basic Search:

Keywords: Mozart symphony 550
217 items retrieved, many are incorrect.

Users can click on the uniform title (as 240 or as title added entry) for a more precise result via the "Find Related Items" browse:

Find Related Items



Find other items in the Melvyl Catalog

Title (Exact) : Symphonies, K. 550, G minor



Browse this alphabetical index in the Melvyl Catalog

Title (Exact) : Symphonies, K. 550, G minor

Search results: 173 Item(s) [Modify Search](#)

Searched: **Symphonies, K. 550, G minor**
Collection: Entire Collection

[Print / Email](#) [Save](#) [Request](#)

[select all](#) [deselect all](#)

Browse Previous: [Symphonies, K. 550, G major](#)

Title (Exact)

Current: Symphonies, K. 550, G minor

Browse Next: [Symphonies, K. 550, G minor, 1956.](#)

1 [Details/Locations](#)

Author [Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus, 1756-1791](#)

Melvyl Advanced Search

Author/Title: Mozart/550

220 items retrieved. Search correctly retrieved the “550” as an element of the uniform title, including variant extensions to the uniform title as shown in the Browse Lists option:

Browse an Alphabetical Index: Entire Collection [Change Collection](#)

Browse:

Browse Lists: Title (Exact) [Previous](#) [Next](#)

Items	Title (Exact)
999	Symphonies, K. 550, G minor
1	Symphonies, K. 550, G minor, 1956.
1	Symphonies, K. 550, G minor, 1963.
1	Symphonies, K. 550, G minor, 1967.
1	Symphonies, K. 550, G minor, 1968.
2	Symphonies, K. 550, G minor, 1970.
1	Symphonies, K. 550, G minor, 1971.
2	Symphonies, K. 550, G minor, 1973.
1	Symphonies, K. 550, G minor, 1979.
1	Symphonies, K. 550, G minor, 1980.

World Cat Local 1:

Keyword: Mozart symphony 550

637 items retrieved, almost all correct.

World Cat Local 2:

Title: 550

Author: Mozart

176 items retrieved, almost all correct. Missing from the result are items that are only cataloged by uniform title without a content note or added entry for the conventional title.

For WorldCat Local, the uniform title does not display at any level nor as a browse list option. Is the uniform title also searched as "Title" to produce a complete result list?

Case 4: music for a popular song in any form

User(s)

Users include undergraduate students, graduate students and faculty members.

Assumptions

Description of use

The user is looking for a CD and music (sheet music or in an anthology) of a known popular song.

Current method of support

Melvyl Basic Search 1:

Keywords [Words as Phrase yes]: my heart will go on

26 items retrieved, mostly music and recordings. The song is usually part of album recording or score anthology, often noted only in the catalog record contents field, not as a title added entry.

Melvyl Basic Search 2:

Title [Words as Phrase yes]: my heart will go on

Unsuccessful, only one item retrieved (title from title field only).

World Cat Local 1:

Keyword: my heart will go on

2,566 items retrieved.

World Cat Local 2:

Keyword: "my heart will go on" [phrase search]

803 items retrieved, almost all relevant music, from the phrase in a title or contents field.

World Cat Local 3:

Title: my heart will go on

39 items retrieved, an incomplete result as only title fields (not the contents field) were searched. Comparison to above search indicates hundreds of relevant items were not retrieved.

As an example of a general problem with the WorldCat Local, the "Refine your Search" options for this search include the following:

Content

Music (11)

Philosophy & Religio... (2)

Sociology (1)

Format

Musical Score (23)

Sound Recording (8)

Book (7)

Article (2)

The "Music" result has both scores and recordings, however the number of these items are considerably less than the total of the "Musical Score" and "Sound Recording" numbers.

Case 5: Sheet music for a popular song from a musical.

User(s)

- The users include undergraduate students, graduate students and faculty members.

Assumptions

- The user does not know the name of the musical, or the composer or lyricist, only the title of the song.

Description of use

- Using the song title “We need a little Christmas” from the Broadway musical Mame. Music by Jerry Herman, lyrics by Jerome Lawrence and Robert E. Lee.

Current method of support

Melvyl Basic Search:

Title: We need a little Christmas
Limit to: scores (music)

0 items retrieved.

Search retrieves no items (although UCLA owns several copies of the sheet music that is cataloged separately with the title “We Need a Little Christmas”).

Melvyl Basic Search:

Keyword: We need a little Christmas
Limit to: scores (music)

9 items retrieved, 7 are not relevant, 2 contain this song.

World Cat Local:

Basic Search

Keyword: We need a little Christmas

466 items retrieved. In the first group of 10 items, 2-4 and 6 are anthologies that contain this song.

Clicking on Format Musical Scores reduces the list to 137. In the first screen, all are relevant.

There are two issues with this search related to the way World Cat Local Works.

Among the list of limits on the left side of the screen, one is labeled Content. The Content list seems to be based on subject headings. In this particular case clicking on Music reduces the list to 222, although for this case that is not really helpful because you still have a mixture of sound recordings and music scores (sheet music). This

feature is very likely to be confusing to users. What does Content Music mean? printed music, sound recordings, books about music, novels about music, all of the above?

The record display will very likely confuse many users who will wonder how the bibliographic records they are seeing are related to what they entered. This issue could be solved if the contents note appeared in the individual record display. For music, it is very useful that the Keyword Search searches contents notes since often users are looking for a song or piece of music that is one among many on a recording or in an anthology. So that they will know they found what they are looking for, it has to show in the record display. In some systems the keywords searched are highlighted, and that is a very useful feature.

Case 6: Recording of a popular song by a specific singer.

User(s)

The users include undergraduate students, graduate students and faculty members.

Assumptions

Description of use

- The user wants to find a popular song by a specific singer.

Current method of support

Melvyl Basic Search:

Keywords: billie holiday strange fruit
Limit: sound recordings

23 items retrieved. All are relevant.

World Cat Local:

Keywords: billie holiday strange fruit

After clicking on the Refine Your Search, Sound Recordings, link, the first page of items are all relevant.

Case 7. Hip Hop music

User(s)

- The users include undergraduate students, graduate students and faculty members.

Assumptions

Description of use

- The user wants to find some recordings of hip hop music.

Current method of support

Melvyl Basic Search:

Keywords: hip hop music

Limit: sound recordings

Results: 70 items. All are relevant.

World Cat Local:

Keyword: hip hop music

Results: 2179 records. Among the first 10 records, all are relevant.

Case 8: Browse music for a common combination of instruments

User(s)

Users include undergraduates, graduates, faculty, and members of the community. Skill levels vary.

Assumptions

- may wish to methodically browse through a list of the music for the specific combination
- may or may not be aware of various search strategies, including the ability to choose subject headings, search by LC class, browse lists of headings, etc.

Description of use

User wishes to find scores of music for a specific combination of instruments (e.g. trumpet and piano) and *only* that combination (e.g. not trumpet, piano, and voice).

Current method of support

Melvyl Basic Search 1:

Keywords: trumpet piano
Format: Scores (music)

874 items retrieved. Result set is imprecise. It includes scores for trumpet and piano only, but also many other types of scores such as chamber music for various combinations of instruments that include trumpet and piano, jazz play-alongs, piano anthologies, vocal music, etc.

Melvyl Basic Search 2:

Subject: trumpet piano
Format: Scores (music)

720 items retrieved. Set is more precise than Search 1. Approximately 75 percent correct, 25 percent incorrect. Incorrect items are scores for various combinations of instruments that include trumpet and piano.

Melvyl Advanced Search:

Call number: m260 [or m261, m1031, m1131, m1206]
Format: Scores (music)

Search on m260 retrieves 27 items. All correct (although some may be for cornet and piano, or trumpet and other keyboard instrument [e.g. organ]).

Melvyl Browse Search 1:

Subject begins with: trumpet and piano music

Result is a browse list of subject headings:

Melvyl The Catalog of the University of California Libraries

Sign In (optional)
Quit

Basic Search Advanced Command Browse Most Recent Search Previous Search

Browse an Alphabetical Index: **Entire Collection** [Change Collection](#)

Browse: Subject begins with

[Browse](#) [Clear](#)

Browse Lists: **Subject** [Previous](#) [Next](#)

Items	Subject
1	Trumpet and piano), Arranged -- Scores and parts.
999	Trumpet and piano music - [more terms]
32	Trumpet and piano music, Arranged - [more terms]
1	Trumpet and piano music, Arranged -- 17th century -- Scores and parts.
1	Trumpet and piano music, Arranged -- 18th century -- Scores and parts.
3	Trumpet and piano music, Arranged -- Scores.
41	Trumpet and piano music, Arranged -- Scores and parts
1	Trumpet and piano music, Arranged -- Solo with piano.
1	Trumpet and piano music (Jazz)
1	Trumpet and piano music -- Juvenile -- Scores and parts

[Previous](#) [Next](#)

Basic Search Advanced Command Browse Most Recent Search Previous Search

CDL Comments and feedback
Melvyl is an initiative of the California Digital Library
© 2006 The Regents of the University of California

Select headings that include the subdivision Score and parts. Or scroll to next page of headings:

Melvyl The Catalog of the University of California Libraries

Sign In (optional)
Quit

Basic Search Advanced Command Browse Most Recent Search Previous Search

Browse an Alphabetical Index: **Entire Collection** [Change Collection](#)

Browse: Subject begins with

[Browse](#) [Clear](#)

Browse Lists: **Subject** [Previous](#) [Next](#)

Items	Subject
13	Trumpet and piano music -- Scores.
999	Trumpet and piano music -- Scores and parts.
2	Trumpet and piano with chamber orchestra - [more terms]
1	Trumpet and piano with string orchestra - [more terms]
	Trumpet and saxophone music - [more terms] See: Saxophone and trumpet music
1	Trumpet and saxophone quartet with orchestra
1	Trumpet and string orchestra music, Arranged.
4	Trumpet and timpani music - [more terms]
1	Trumpet and timpani music -- Scores and parts
	Trumpet and trombone music - [more terms] See: Trombone and trumpet music

[Previous](#) [Next](#)

Basic Search Advanced Command Browse Most Recent Search Previous Search

CDL Comments and feedback
Melvyl is an initiative of the California Digital Library
© 2006 The Regents of the University of California

Select Trumpet and piano music – Scores and parts. 144 items are retrieved under this heading. All correct.

Melvyl Browse Search 2:

Call number: m260 [or m261, m1031, m1131, m1206]

The screenshot shows the Melvyl catalog interface. At the top, there is a navigation bar with links for 'Basic Search', 'Advanced', 'Command', and 'Browse'. On the right, there are links for 'Sign In (optional)' and 'Quit'. Below the navigation bar, there is a search bar with a dropdown menu set to 'Call Number' and a text input field containing 'm260'. There are 'Browse' and 'Clear' buttons. Below the search bar, there is a section titled 'Browse Lists: Call Number' with 'Previous' and 'Next' navigation links. The main content area displays a list of items with columns for 'Items' and 'Call Number'. The items listed are:

Items	Call Number
1	M259 .TARKI C37 Hungarian election study, 1990 principal investigators, Peter Robert, Janos Szanto and Gabor Toka
1	M260 .A553 Album of classical pieces for trumpet and piano / [edited by] Roger Voisin.
1	M260 .A7 Trumpet solos.
1	M260 Annual report of long term care facilities, 1994 principal investigator, California Office of Statewide Health Planning and
1	M260 .B2 Ballads / [as played by] Wynton Marsalis ; transcribed by David Pugh, David Pearl, and Tom Toriello.
1	M260 .B36 Baroque music : for trumpet / edited and annotated [with continuo realisations] by Peter Wastall.
1	M260 .B37 1979 Baroque music : for trumpet / edited and annotated [with continuo realisations] by Peter Wastall
1	M260 .B37 1997 The baroque trumpet / selected and arranged by John Miller
1	M260 .B37 1997 The baroque trumpet / selected and arranged by John Miller.
1	M260.B5 S6 1963 Solos for the trumpet (cornet) player, with piano acc

At the bottom of the page, there is a footer with the CDL logo and text: 'Comments and feedback Melvyl® is an initiative of the California Digital Library © 2006 The Regents of the University of California'.

All items displayed in the browse list are correct. The user can scroll through the list of M260 and continue through M261, selecting items of interest.

World Cat Local 1:

Keyword: trumpet piano scores

Retrieves 5,678 items. About 90 percent correct.

World Cat Local 2:

Keyword: trumpet piano
Format: Musical Score

Retrieves about 9,724 items, about 60 percent correct (incorrect items include additional instruments).

World Cat Local 3:

Subject: trumpet piano
Format: Musical Score

Retrieves about 5,317 items, about 75 percent correct (the same rate as for the same search in Melvyl).

Case 9: Search for parts for a specific musical work

User(s)

Users include undergraduates, graduates, faculty, and members of the community. Skill levels vary.

Assumptions

Description of use

User wants to find parts for a specific work of chamber music, Beethoven's Septet op. 20

Current method of support

Melvyl Basic Search 1:

Keywords: beethoven septet
Format: Scores (music)

Out of 42 items retrieved, 13 are correct. Incorrect items are manifestations of the work that do not include parts, such as study scores and arrangements.

Melvyl Basic Search 2:

Title: septet op 20
Format: Scores (music)

Out of 38 items retrieved, 12 are correct. Incorrect items are manifestations of the work that do not include parts, such as study scores and arrangements.

Melvyl Basic Search 3:

Keywords: beethoven septet parts

Out of 14 results, 11 are correct. The other three are arrangements.

Melvyl Advanced Search 1:

Author: beethoven
Title: septet

Subject: parts

13 retrieved, 11 correct.

Melvyl Advanced Search 2:

Author: beethoven

Subject: septets parts

11 retrieved, all correct. (In this case there was high precision because Beethoven wrote only one septet.)

World Cat Local 1:

Keyword: beethoven septet parts

Out of 41 items retrieved, 4 are correct.

World Cat Local 2:

Keyword: parts

Title: septet

Author: beethoven

Out of 7 items retrieved, 3 are correct.

World Cat Local 3:

Title: septet

Author: beethoven

Subject: parts

Out of 6 items retrieved, 2 are correct.

World Cat Local 4:

Author: beethoven

Subject: septets parts

Out of 14 items retrieved, 5 are correct.

Case 10: Search for an opera on DVD

User(s)

Users include undergraduates, graduates, faculty, and members of the community. Skill levels vary.

Assumptions

Description of use

User wants to find a specific opera in a specific, common video format: *La Boheme* on DVD

Current methods of support

Melvyl Advanced Search:

Title: boheme
Keywords: dvd

0 results. Not supported. 538 field is not searchable.

Melvyl Basic Search:

Title: boheme
Format: Videorecordings

33 items retrieved, 6 are correct. The incorrect items are either (1) a performance of the opera *La Boheme*, but incorrect format, i.e. laserdisc or VHS; or (2) not a performance of the opera *La Boheme*. The only way to determine whether an item is a DVD is to see whether the physical description field says "4 ¾ in."

World Cat Local 1:

Keyword: boheme dvd

Out of 96 items retrieved, about 20 percent are correct.

World Cat Local 2:

Keyword: dvd
Title: boheme

16 items retrieved, 11 correct.

World Cat Local 3:

Title: boheme

Author: puccini
Format: Visual Material

60 items retrieved, 9 correct (15 percent)

Case 11: video of a specific performer

User(s)

- The users include undergraduate students, graduate students and faculty members.

Assumptions

Description of use

- The user is looking for video of a specific performance.

Current method of support

Melvyl Basic Search:

Keywords: miles davis
Limit: videorecordings

21 items retrieved. All are relevant.

World Cat Local:

Keyword: miles davis

Results: 4683 records.

Number 9 in the list is a DVD, number 19 is a VHS tape.

This search is hampered by the use of “visual material” to indicate video. There needs to be a way to limit search results to video in language a user would understand.

Keyword: miles davis DVD

Results 121. All relevant.
